The CO<sub>2</sub> record from the EPICA Dome C ice core reveals that atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> variations during glacial-interglacial cycles had a notably different character before and after 430 kyr B.P. Before MIS 11, the amplitude of temperature was lower, and the duration of the warm phases has been much longer since then. In spite of these differences, the significant covariation of  $\delta D$  and  $CO_2$  is valid in both periods. Before MIS 11, CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations did not exceed 260 ppmv. This is substantially lower than the maxima of the last four glacial cycles. The lags of CO2 with respect to the Antarctic temperature over glacial terminations V to VII are 800, 1600, and 2800 years, respectively, which are consistent with earlier observations during the last four glacial cycles.

Our measurements have revealed an unexpected stable climate phase (MIS 15.1) during which the atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration was 251.5 ± 1.9 ppmv for many millennia (28,000 years, based on the EDC2 time scale), although the duration of MIS 15.1 is uncertain because of possible inaccuracies in the Dome C EDC2 time scale between MIS 12 and 15. However, the roughly 30,000-year duration of MIS 11 (and possibly MIS 15.1) demonstrates that long interglacials with stable conditions are not exceptional. Short interglacials such as the past three therefore are not the rule and hence cannot serve as analogs of the Holocene, as postulated recently (24). Examining  $\delta D$  as a function of CO<sub>2</sub>, we observe that the slope during the two new glacial cycles compared to the last four cycles is essentially the same. Therefore, the coupling of Antarctic temperature and CO<sub>2</sub> did not change significantly during the last 650 kyear, indicating rather stable coupling between climate and the carbon cycle during the late Pleistocene.

#### **References and Notes**

- 1. L. Augustin *et al.*, (EPICA community members), *Nature* **429**, 623 (2004).
- J.-M. Barnola, D. Raynaud, Y. S. Korotkevich, C. Lorius, *Nature* 329, 408 (1987).
- D. M. Etheridge *et al.*, *J. Geophys. Res.* **101**, 4115 (1996).
   B. Stauffer *et al.*, *Nature* **392**, 59 (1998).
- 5. H. Fischer, M. Wahlen, J. Smith, D. Mastroianni, B.
- Deck, Science 283, 1712 (1999).
- 6. A. Indermühle et al., Nature 398, 121 (1999).
- 7. J. R. Petit et al., Nature **399**, 429 (1999).
- A. Indermühle, E. Monnin, B. Stauffer, T. F. Stocker, M. Wahlen, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 27, 735 (2000).
- 9. E. Monnin et al., Science 291, 112 (2001).
- 10. K. Kawamura et al., Tellus 55B, 126 (2003).
- 11. E. Monnin et al., Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 224, 45 (2004).
- 12. U. Siegenthaler et al., Tellus 57B, 51 (2005).
- 13. J. Flückiger et al., Global Biogeochem. Cycles 16,
- 1010 (2002).
  14. J. Ahn et al., J. Geophys. Res. 109, 10.1029/ 2003JD004415 (2004).
- 15. P. Falkowski *et al.*, *Science* **290**, 291 (2000).
- Supplementary information concerning methods or assumptions is available on Science Online.
- 17. F. C. Bassinot et al., Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. **126**, 91 (1994).
- 18. J. Jouzel *et al.*, in preparation.
- L. E. Lisiecki, M. E. Raymo, *Paleoceanography* 20, 10.1029/2004PA001071 (2005).
- Atmospheric Methane and Nitrous Oxide of the Late Pleistocene from Antarctic Ice Cores

Renato Spahni,<sup>1</sup> Jérôme Chappellaz,<sup>2</sup> Thomas F. Stocker,<sup>1\*</sup> Laetitia Loulergue,<sup>2</sup> Gregor Hausammann,<sup>1</sup> Kenji Kawamura,<sup>1</sup>† Jacqueline Flückiger,<sup>1</sup>‡ Jakob Schwander,<sup>1</sup> Dominique Raynaud,<sup>2</sup> Valérie Masson-Delmotte,<sup>3</sup> Jean Jouzel<sup>3</sup>

The European Project for Ice Coring in Antarctica Dome C ice core enables us to extend existing records of atmospheric methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) back to 650,000 years before the present. A combined record of CH<sub>4</sub> measured along the Dome C and the Vostok ice cores demonstrates, within the resolution of our measurements, that preindustrial concentrations over Antarctica have not exceeded 773  $\pm$  15 ppbv (parts per billion by volume) during the past 650,000 years. Before 420,000 years ago, when interglacials were cooler, maximum CH<sub>4</sub> concentrations were only about 600 ppbv, similar to lower Holocene values. In contrast, the N<sub>2</sub>O record shows maximum concentrations of 278  $\pm$  7 ppbv, slightly higher than early Holocene values.

Earth's climate during the late Pleistocene was characterized by ice age cycles with relatively short warm periods (interglacials) and longer cold periods (glacials) (1). The Vostok ice core provided an archive of climate and atmospheric composition over

the past four climatic cycles back to marine isotope stage (MIS) 11, about 420 thousand years before the present (420 kyr B.P.) (2). That record demonstrated the high correlation of temperature changes with greenhouse gas concentration changes in the atmo-

- D. W. Oppo, J. F. McManus, J. L. Cullen, *Science* 279, 1335 (1998).
   J. F. McManus, D. W. Oppo, J. L. Cullen, *Science* 283, 971 (1999).
- 22. B. P. Flower et al., Paleoceanography 15, 388 (2000).
- A. Landais et al., J. Geophys. Res. 109, 10.1029/ 2003 JD004193 (2004).
- 24. W. F. Ruddiman, Clim. Change 61, 261 (2003).
- F. Joos, S. Gerber, I. C. Prentice, B. L. Otto-Bliesner, P. J. Valdes, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 18, 10.1029/ 2003GB002156 (2004).
- 26. R. Spahni et al., Science 310, 1317 (2005).
- 27. E. W. Wolff et al, in preparation.
- 28. D. Raynaud et al., Nature 436, 39 (2005).
- 29. V. Masson et al., Quaternary Res. 54, 348 (2000).
- 30. J. Schwander, B. Stauffer, Nature 311, 45 (1984).
- J. Schwander et al., Geophys. Res. Lett. 28, 4243 (2001).
   N. Caillon et al., Science 299, 1728 (2003).
- 33. J. Jouzel *et al.*, *Nature* **329**, 403 (1987).
- 34. We thank K. Kawamura and G. Teste for assisting with
- (4) We thank K. Kawamura and C. Teste for assisting with the CO<sub>2</sub> measurements, L Lisiecki and M. Raymo for access to the data of (79), and R. Spahni and F. Parrenin for fruitful discussions. This work is a contribution to the EPICA, a joint European Science Foundation/ European Commission (EC) scientific program funded by the EC and by national contributions from Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, and United Kingdom. We acknowledge long-term financial support by the Swiss National Science Foundation, the University of Bern, the Swiss Federal Office of Energy, and EC Project EPICA-MIS. This is EPICA publication no. 133.

### Supporting Online Material

www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/310/5752/1313/ DC1

Materials and Methods Figs. S1 and S2 References

13 September 2005; accepted 1 November 2005 10.1126/science.1120130

sphere in the past. The European Project for Ice Coring in Antarctica (EPICA) Dome Concordia (Dome C) ice core (75°06'S, 123°21'E, 3233 m above sea level) provides an ice core archive much longer, spanning eight climatic cycles over the past 740 thousand years (ky) (3). It demonstrates that the oldest four interglacials were cooler but lasted longer than the younger interglacials. Such findings raise the question whether the greenhouse gases  $CH_4$  and  $N_2O$  behaved differently before MIS 11. Here, we present  $CH_4$  and  $N_2O$  records derived from the EPICA Dome C ice cores reaching back to 650 kyr B.P.

\*To whom correspondence should be addressed: stocker@climate.unibe.ch

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Climate and Environmental Physics, Physics Institute, University of Bern, Sidlerstrasse 5, CH-3012 Bern, Switzerland. <sup>2</sup>Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Géophysique de l'Environnement (LGGE, CNRS-UJF), CNRS, 54 Rue Molières, 38402 St. Martin d'Hères, Grenoble, France. <sup>3</sup>Institut Pierre Simon Laplace/Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, CEA-CNRS 1572, CE Saclay, Orme des Merisiers, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette, France.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>Present address: Scripps Institution of Oceanography, University of California, San Diego, 9500 Gilman Drive, La Jolla, CA 92093–0244, USA.

Present address: Institute of Arctic and Alpine Research, University of Colorado at Boulder, 450 UCB Boulder, Colorado 80309–0450, USA.

## REPORTS

Extracting air from bubbles trapped in polar ice enables us to reconstruct directly the past composition of the atmosphere. The records of CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O over the past thousand years (4-6), the Holocene (7, 8), the transition from the last glacial maximum (LGM) to the Holocene (6, 9), parts of the last glacial period (10-14), and the last four glacialinterglacial cycles (2, 15-17) have provided important information about environmental changes in response to regional and global climate variations. Variations in the concentration of globally well-mixed atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> are attributed to variations in the extent and the productivity of natural wetlands, the main natural sources (18). Similarly, variations in the atmospheric N<sub>2</sub>O burden are thought to be dominated by variations in the global source strength. About two-thirds of the total preanthropogenic N<sub>2</sub>O sources are terrestrial soils, and one-third are nitrification and denitrification processes in the ocean (13).

We present high-resolution records of  $CH_4$  and  $N_2O$  covering MISs 2 to 7 (Fig. 1), to compare with existing records, and MISs 11 to 16 (Fig. 2), to extend the records back to an age of 650 kyr B.P. Measurements were performed along the EPICA Dome C ice cores (EDC96 and EDC99) at 553 and 476 different depth levels for CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, respectively, at the University of Bern and at Laboratoire de Glaciologie et Géophysique de l'Environnement (LGGE) (19). The mean CH<sub>4</sub> time resolution is 770 years for MISs 2 to 7 and 840 years for MISs 11 to 16. All ages and their uncertainties are based on the EPICA EDC2 gas and ice age scales (3). N<sub>2</sub>O analyses were performed only at Bern. Their resolution is similar for MISs 2 to 7 (760 years) but lower for MISs 12 to 16 (1110 years). To be consistent with existing Dome C data, offset corrections for both gases and both laboratories have been applied (19).

The Dome C N<sub>2</sub>O record is disturbed by artifacts in certain depth intervals as in other ice cores (6, 13, 17, 20). High scattering of N<sub>2</sub>O values is observed in depth intervals with elevated dust concentrations (19) (figs. S1 and S2) during parts of the cold periods MISs 2, 4, 6, 12, 14, and 16 (fig. S3). The EPICA Dome C dust record (19) is used to define depth intervals where the dust concentration exceeds 300 ppbw (parts per billion by weight). N<sub>2</sub>O measurements in these depths are considered to be disturbed by artifacts and excluded from the record (fig. S3). The good agreement of the remaining record with records measured along other ice cores (Fig. 1) with different characteristics in the concentration of chemical impurities (6, 13, 14, 17) supports the assumption that this record shows atmospheric concentrations of the past. Although all samples might be contaminated at some level, no outliers are observed during the



**Fig. 1.** Dome C CH<sub>4</sub> (purple line), N<sub>2</sub>O (red line), and  $\delta$ D (black line) (3) records over the past 220 ky. Also shown are Vostok CH<sub>4</sub> data (blue line) (2, 15) and  $\delta$ D data (gray line) (2). Vostok  $\delta$ D data were increased by 42‰ for better comparison. The Vostok CH<sub>4</sub> and  $\delta$ D records were individually synchronized to Dome C using wiggle matching (35). N<sub>2</sub>O artifacts (open red diamonds) are separated from the N<sub>2</sub>O record (red filled diamonds) with the aid of the dust record (figs. S1 to S3). Additionally, N<sub>2</sub>O records published earlier (gray lines and crosses) (6, 13, 17), matched by CH<sub>4</sub> to Dome C, are shown for comparison. Error bars represent the 1 SD measurement uncertainty. Dome C CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O data over the Holocene (8), the transition (9, 36), and the LGM (20, 36) are included in this data set. Dome C measurements covering the time period 0 to 40 kyr B.P. (depth interval 99.5 to 783.8 m) were performed along the EDC96 core, whereas older samples are from the EDC99 core. Numbers 0 to 25 above the CH<sub>4</sub> record denote D/O events (23), and A1 to A7 denote Antarctic warming events (37). Data are plotted on the EDC2 time scale (3).



**Fig. 2.** Dome C CH<sub>4</sub> (purple line) and N<sub>2</sub>O (red line) records over the period of MISs 11 to 16, together with high-resolution  $\delta D$  data from Dome C (24) (black line). CH<sub>4</sub> measurements performed at Bern are shown as purple diamonds, whereas LGGE measurements are shown as purple circles. N<sub>2</sub>O artifacts (red open diamonds) are separated from the N<sub>2</sub>O record (red filled diamonds) with the aid of the dust record (figs. S1 to S3). Error bars represent the 1 SD measurement uncertainty. Dome C CH<sub>4</sub> data over termination V (3) is included in this data set. Parts of the CH<sub>4</sub> record marked with a star (\*) are regular events whose amplitude could be strongly influenced by the precession signal as seen in low-to mid-northern latitude summer insolation. MISs are labeled on the bottom (cold stages) and top (warm stages) of the  $\delta D$  record. Data are shown on the EDC2 time scale (3).

highly resolved Holocene. This supports our assumption that other interglacials are also likely free from artifacts.

The Dome C CH<sub>4</sub> data over the last two glacial cycles (Fig. 1) are in good agreement with the Vostok  $CH_4$  record (15, 19), as well as Greenland CH<sub>4</sub> records, when taking into account the interpolar difference (7, 21) and the signal attenuation at low accumulation sites (22). The Dome C  $CH_4$  data over the last glacial period confirm the close relation with the 25 Dansgaard/Oeschger (D/O) events as recorded in the North Greenland Ice-Core Project (NGRIP) temperature proxies (23). In addition, we find that N<sub>2</sub>O also varied during the last glacial period in parallel with the most prominent D/O events (Fig. 1), in agreement with previous results (6, 13, 14, 16). N<sub>2</sub>O reaches Holocene concentrations of 253 to 272 ppbv (parts per billion by volume) (single values) (8) during the maximum of some of these events and during the last interglacial (14, 17). The lowest values found, about 200 ppbv, are similar to those in records published earlier (13, 14). Because the  $CH_4$  and  $N_2O$  measurements were performed on the same extracted air samples, a direct comparison without relative time uncertainty is possible between the two gases. The start and end points of single D/O events in CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O do not necessarily coincide (13); e.g., the N<sub>2</sub>O concentrations at D/O event 21 start to rise more than 1000 years earlier than  $CH_{4}$ concentrations. Furthermore, N2O remains at interglacial values for this specific event,

Fig. 3. (A) Dome C  $CO_2$  (26) (green line), CH<sub>4</sub> (purple line), and N<sub>2</sub>O (red line) records over the period of MISs 13 to 14 as shown in Fig. 2, together with high-resolution  $\delta D$  data from Dome C (24) (black line). Vertical dashed lines highlight the coincidence of local  $CO_2$ ,  $CH_4$ , and N<sub>2</sub>O maxima. Data are plotted on the EDC2 time scale (3). (B) CH records from Dome C (purple line) and Vostok (15, 30) (blue line), together with highresolution  $\delta D$  data from Dome C (24) (black line) covering MIS 11 (labeled at the bottom). The data from MIS 1 are shown as gray lines (time axis on top) for comparison; the curves are aligned by synchronizing the two glacial-interglacial CH<sub>4</sub>

when  $CH_4$  has already dropped to glacial values at the end of the event. The amplitude of some events differs substantially between the two gases as demonstrated by D/O events 19 and 20, also shown in the GRIP record (13) (Fig. 1).

The depth interval from 2700 to 3060 m in the EPICA Dome C core permits us to make reconstructions of climate and atmospheric composition for the interval 390 to 650 kyr B.P., most of which precedes the Vostok record (2). CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O measurements performed over this depth interval are shown in Fig. 2, together with high-resolution  $\delta D$  measurements (24).

To better characterize warm and cold intervals during the past 650 ky, we refer to "interglacial" as a period during which  $\delta D$  exceeds –403‰ (per mil) (3). The use of this definition marks MISs 1, 5.5, 7.3, 7.5, 9.3, and 11.3 as interglacials, which is consistent with the marine records (1). In the following, we describe the individual counterparts of the marine stages (25) from MISs 16.2 to 11.2.

At 624 kyr B.P., at the end of MIS 16.2,  $CH_4$  falls to a value of 368 ppbv (mean over 7 ky), comparable to the low  $CH_4$  concentration during MIS 6 and MIS 2 in the Dome C record. The increase (termination VII) into MIS 15.5 by about 250 ppbv is smaller than at the younger terminations I, II, IV, and V (15). While  $CH_4$  only reaches the mean Holocene (0.3 to 10 kyr B.P.) level of 608 ppbv during MIS 15.1 (600 ppbv, mean over 27 ky) and 15.5 (617 ppbv, mean over 7 ky),

the corresponding mean N<sub>2</sub>O concentrations of 272 ppbv and 274 ppbv are higher than the Holocene mean (262 ppbv) but similar to early Holocene values. Both records, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O, show the distinct separation of MISs 15.1 and 15.5 (Fig. 2) by lower concentrations and three shorter events each during the colder near-glacial periods of MISs 15.2 to 15.4. MIS 15.1 is a surprisingly stable climatic period (1 SD:  $\pm$  15 ppbv CH<sub>4</sub>,  $\pm$  6 ppbv N<sub>2</sub>O). Its duration is about 27 ky on the EDC2 age scale. A similar duration is seen in the records of  $\delta D$  (24) and CO<sub>2</sub> (26); related uncertainties are discussed in (26).

In Fig. 3A,  $\delta D$  is plotted together with  $CO_2$  (26),  $CH_4$ , and  $N_2O$ , showing the transition from MISs 14 to 13. During MIS 14, the three gases are closely linked in terms of their timing: Relative maxima (dashed lines) occur at the same time within the data resolution. One of these maxima corresponds to MIS 14.3. CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, and  $N_2O$  seem to lead the  $\delta D$  record and therefore, Antarctic temperature, by about  $2000 \pm 500$  years. However, this could be due to an artifact in the EDC2 time scale, as discussed in Siegenthaler et al. (26). During MIS 13, the relative CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O maxima are slightly out of phase. In contrast to younger glacial terminations (2), the temperatures do not rise directly to a local maximum. Instead, the  $\delta D$ , CO<sub>2</sub>, and CH<sub>4</sub> records reveal a transition to the warmest phase (MIS 13.1), which evolves in steps with relapses in between. Nevertheless, sequences of the CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> increases to



increases. Error bars represent the 1 SD measurement uncertainty. Data are plotted on the EDC2 age scale (3).

## REPORTS

MISs 13.3 and 13.1 look similar to those of the last deglaciation (9):  $CO_2$  rises first,  $CH_4$ is delayed, and CO<sub>2</sub> stops rising when CH<sub>4</sub> rises abruptly. In comparison to the last deglaciation, the  $CH_4$  rise at 513 kyr B.P. is rather small. This may be explained by the colder interglacial temperatures that would have favored a relative increase in methanotrophy over methanogenesis, thereby contributing to lowered net CH<sub>4</sub> emissions in the northern extratropics and/or the subtropical and tropical regions. Additionally, the Northern Hemisphere ice sheets may not have retreated as far north during MIS 13. As a consequence, the uncovered areal extent of additional CH<sub>4</sub> source regions was smaller and therefore, the  $CH_{4}$  overshoot, usually found at terminations, may not have occurred.

At this point, it is difficult to characterize MISs 13 and 15 as interglacials, because the δD values barely exceed -403‰. We therefore refer to these periods as intermediate warm periods (IWP) (27). This and their specific evolution of CH<sub>4</sub> suggests that they are similar to MISs 5.1 to 5.3 and MISs 7.1 to 7.3 (2) (Fig. 4). In all cases, regular events with CH<sub>4</sub> amplitudes of 50 to 140 ppbv occurred, similar to events marked by stars in Fig. 2. The average return time of the events during MIS 13 is approximately 20 ky, and they last for 5 to 10 ky. The origin of these fluctuations is probably related to the precession cycle (19 to 23 ky) of summer insolation in mid-low to low northern latitudes, as observed for the CH<sub>4</sub> amplitude during the last glacial period (13). The N<sub>2</sub>O amplitude appears to be modulated by different mechanisms from those responsible for CH<sub>4</sub>, as seen in MISs 13 and 15 (e.g., at 498 and 596 kyr B.P.), where N<sub>2</sub>O peaks are quite large despite the small CH<sub>4</sub> peaks. Similar discrepancies are in fact found in the last glacial period, e.g., at D/O events 19 and 20 (13).

MIS 12 is believed to be a very cold period showing millennial time-scale variations similar to those observed in the last glacial period (28). The Dome C record shows CH<sub>4</sub> variations lasting about 1 to 3 ky, with amplitudes of 40 to 120 ppbv (Fig. 2). In addition, Antarctic warming events of 7 to 19‰ are present in the  $\delta$ D record. Their independent evolution on millennial time scales is an indication that the bipolar seesaw may have been operational also during MIS 12 (29), but the resolution of our measurements and the uncertainty in their timing prevent us from drawing final conclusions.

Our CH<sub>4</sub> measurements provide an undisturbed record for the entire MIS 11 (Fig. 3B) and support, except for a small offset (19), the recently reconstructed MIS 11 record of Vostok (30). This is important for two reasons. First, MIS 11 is the longest warm phase of the Antarctic temperature record over the past 740 ky (24), with a mean temperature comparable to the Holocene. CH<sub>4</sub> exceeded the minimum Holocene value of 560 ppbv for more than 28 ky. Second, CH<sub>4</sub> increased to 689 ppbv at ter-



**Fig. 4.**  $CH_4$  record over the past 650 ky, composed of Dome C  $CH_4$  (purple line) [(8, 9) and new data] and Vostok  $CH_4$  (blue line) (2, 15). Also shown are the N<sub>2</sub>O data measured along the Dome C ice cores (red line) [(8, 20, 36) and new data] and  $\delta D$  records from Dome C (black line) (24) as well as those from Vostok +42‰ (gray line) (2). N<sub>2</sub>O artifacts are not shown in this figure. Gray shaded areas highlight interglacial periods with a  $\delta D$  value >-403‰ as defined in (3). Numbers of MISs are given at the bottom of the figure (25). Data are shown on the EDC2 time scale (3).

mination V, followed by an early decrease for about 5000 years, which is very similar to the early Holocene  $CH_4$  record (gray curves in Fig. 3B). It then rose to the high concentration of about 700 ppbv. Ruddiman (31) argued that such a behavior of the  $CH_4$ during the early Holocene is due to early anthropogenic interference and that this would be unique. Our data provide a crucial counterexample to this postulated behavior: The early temporary reduction was clearly not an indication of an impending ice age, which started some 20,000 years later in MIS 11, and the increase after this reduction has been established without human influence.

The good agreement between the Dome C and the Vostok (15, 30) record over MISs 1 to 7 and MIS 11 increases our confidence in the fidelity of a composite record of atmospheric  $CH_4$  over the past 650 ky (Fig. 4). The composite record, established by wiggle matching (32), demonstrates, within the resolution of our measurements, that preindustrial atmospheric concentrations of CH<sub>4</sub> reconstructed from two Antarctic ice cores have not exceeded 773  $\pm$  15 ppbv (single values at MIS 9.3) during the past 650 ky. The highest mean N<sub>2</sub>O values (278 ppbv  $\pm$  7 ppbv) over at least a period of 7 ky covered by our records are found during MIS 15.1, slightly higher than early Holocene values. The differing response to climate change of CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O during MISs 15.1 and 15.5 suggests that the main source regions and/or strengths may strongly differ during interglacials and IWP. High levels are sustained longer for N<sub>2</sub>O than for CH<sub>4</sub> during MISs 5.5, 15.1, and 15.3 (Fig. 4), either due to the release of oceanic N2O or because N<sub>2</sub>O soil sources are also productive under semiarid conditions (13).

In general, CH4 is well correlated with  $\delta D$  on glacial-interglacial time scales (>40 ky), including lower CH<sub>4</sub> concentrations during the IWP than during interglacials of the past 420 ky. At terminations, the amplitude of the CH4 increase is highly correlated with the corresponding Antarctic temperature ( $r^2 = 0.80$ ). CH<sub>4</sub> has mainly tropical and Northern Hemisphere sources, but only very small austral sources (mainly open-ocean contributions), which suggests that the generally smaller glacial-interglacial temperature change before 440 kyr B.P. revealed by Dome C \deltaD was also of global importance at that time (33). The precessional insolation signal in low- to midnorthern latitudes has a strong influence on the amplitude of CH4 variations for glacial periods and IWP, but the Northern wetlands, episodically covered by boreal ice sheets and exposed to different precipitation patterns, are likely to contribute to this D/O-like variability of the  $CH_4$  concentration (21). Furthermore, sink feedbacks, through changes of hydrocarbon emissions from the terrestrial biosphere, could have been considerable (34).

#### **References and Notes**

- 1. L. E. Lisiecki, M. E. Raymo, *Paleoceanography* 20, PA1003 (2005).
- 2. J. R. Petit et al., Nature **387**, 359 (1999).
- EPICA Community Members, Nature 431, 147 (2004).
   T. Blunier et al., Geophys. Res. Lett. 20, 2219 (1993).
- D. M. Etheridge, L. P. Steele, R. J. Francey, R. L. Langenfelds, *J. Geophys. Res.* **103**, 15979 (1998).
- 6. J. Flückiger et al., Science 285, 227 (1999).
- J. Chappellaz et al., J. Geophys. Res. 102, 15987 (1997).
- J. Flückiger et al., Global Biogeochem. Cycles 16, 1010 (2002).
- 9. E. Monnin et al., Science 291, 112 (2001).
- T. Blunier *et al.*, *Nature* **394**, 739 (1998).
   E. J. Brook, T. Sowers, J. Orchardo, *Science* **273**, 1087 (1996).
- J. Chappellaz et al., Nature 366, 443 (1993).
   J. Flückiger et al., Global Biogeochem. Cycles 18,
- GB1020 (2004). 14. T. Sowers, R. B. Alley, J. Jubenville, *Science* **301**, 945 (2003).
- M. Delmotte et al., J. Geophys. Res. 109, D12104 (2004).
   K. Kawamura, thesis, Tohoku University, Tohoku,
- Japan (2000). 17. T. Sowers, J. Geophys. Res. **106**, 31903 (2001).

- 18. J. Chappellaz, I. Y. Fung, A. M. Thompson, *Tellus* **45B**, 228 (1993).
- 19. Materials and methods are available as supporting material on *Science* Online.
- B. Stauffer, J. Flückiger, E. Monnin, T. Nakazawa, S. Aoki, Mem. Natl. Inst. Polar Res. 57, 139 (2003).
- 21. A. Dällenbach et al., Geophys. Res. Lett. 27, 1005 (2000).
- 22. R. Spahni et al., Geophys. Res. Lett. 30, 1571 (2003).
- 23. NorthGRIP Project Members, Nature 431, 147 (2004).
- 24. J. Jouzel, in preparation.
- M. Sarnthein, R. Tiedemann, *Paleoceanography* 5, 1 (1990).
- 26. U. Siegenthaler et al., Science 310, 1313 (2005).
- 27. For MISs 13.1, 13.3, 15.1, and 15.5, δD barely exceeds -403‰, so we use the term intermediate warm period (IWP) for those periods with a lower δD that is still above -425‰ (minimum at MIS 13.2 in Fig. 2). This applies also to MISs 5.1, 5.3, 7.1, and 7.3.
- D. W. Oppo, J. F. McManus, J. L. Cullen, Science 279, 1335 (1998).
- 29. T. F. Stocker, S. J. Johnsen, *Paleoceanography* 18, 1087 (2003).
- 30. D. Raynaud et al., Nature 436, 39 (2005).
- 31. W. F. Ruddiman, Clim. Change 61, 261 (2003).
- 32. The synchronization of the Vostok to the longer Dome C record first has been wiggle matched (35) by  $\delta D$ . Then, Vostok gas ages are calculated using Vostok age A55 (15), refined by directly matching (35) CH<sub>4</sub> from Vostok to Dome C in overlapping periods.
- 33. V. Masson-Delmotte et al., in preparation.
- P. J. Valdes, D. J. Beerling, C. E. Johnson, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 32, L02704 (2005).

# Assistance of Microbial Glycolipid Antigen Processing by CD1e

Henri de la Salle,<sup>1\*</sup> Sabrina Mariotti,<sup>2\*</sup> Catherine Angenieux,<sup>1\*</sup> Martine Gilleron,<sup>3\*</sup> Luis-Fernando Garcia-Alles,<sup>4</sup> Dag Malm,<sup>5</sup> Thomas Berg,<sup>6</sup> Samantha Paoletti,<sup>2</sup> Blandine Maître,<sup>1</sup> Lionel Mourey,<sup>4</sup> Jean Salamero,<sup>7</sup> Jean Pierre Cazenave,<sup>8</sup> Daniel Hanau,<sup>1</sup> Lucia Mori,<sup>2</sup> Germain Puzo,<sup>3</sup>† Gennaro De Libero<sup>2</sup>†

Complexes between CD1 molecules and self or microbial glycolipids represent important immunogenic ligands for specific subsets of T cells. However, the function of one of the CD1 family members, CD1e, has yet to be determined. Here, we show that the mycobacterial antigens hexamannosylated phosphatidyl-*myo*-inositols (PIM<sub>6</sub>) stimulate CD1b-restricted T cells only after partial digestion of the oligomannose moiety by lysosomal  $\alpha$ -mannosidase and that soluble CD1e is required for this processing. Furthermore, recombinant CD1e was able to bind glycolipids and assist in the digestion of PIM<sub>6</sub>. We propose that, through this form of glycolipid editing, CD1e helps expand the repertoire of glycolipidic T cell antigens to optimize antimicrobial immune responses.

Particular subsets of T cells recognize lipidic and glycolipidic antigens presented by CD1a, b, c, or d proteins, which are antigenpresenting molecules structurally similar to major histocompatibility complex (MHC) class I proteins (1). However, unlike classical MHC molecules, CD1 proteins are functionally nonpolymorphic and expressed in a restricted number of cell types, including myeloid dendritic cells (DCs) (2). Each CD1 isotype can be characterized by a distinct intracellular trafficking pathway, which allows the capture of lipid antigens either in late or early endosomal compartments (2). In particular, CD1b binds glycolipid antigens in MHC class II–enriched lysosomes (*3*) and returns to the plasma membrane to stimulate antigen-specific T cells.

CD1-presented lipid antigens can be of self (4–7) or microbial (8–14) origin and can include one or more acyl appendages that anchor into the hydrophobic pockets of CD1 protein, as well as a polar moiety directed out toward the T cell receptor (TCR). Exposed amino acids present in  $\alpha$  helices of CD1 molecules, together with polar groups of the antigen, directly interact with the TCR and thus constrain the space be-

- 35. J. Schwander et al., J. Geophys. Res. 102, 19483 (1997).
- 36. B. Stauffer et al., Ann. Glaciol. **35**, 202 (2002).
- 37. T. Blunier, E. J. Brook, Science 291, 109 (2001)
- 38. We thank U. Siegenthaler, F. Lambert, T. Blunier, and B. Stauffer for discussions and two anonymous reviewers for their comments. This is EPICA publication no. 134. This work is a contribution to the European Project for Ice Coring in Antarctica (EPICA), a joint ESF (European Science Foundation)/ European Commission (EC) scientific program, funded by the EC and by national contributions from Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, and the United Kingdom. We acknowledge long-term financial support by the Swiss National Science Foundation and the Swiss Federal Office of Energy for both science and logistic contributions to EPICA and to the University of Bern. Support was also provided by the French program PNEDC (INSU-CNRS), and the EC project EPICA-MIS.

#### Supporting Online Material

www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/310/5752/1317/ DC1

Materials and Methods Figs. S1 to S3 References

13 September 2005; accepted 2 November 2005 10.1126/science.1120132

tween CD1 and TCR (7, 12, 15, 16). Because such constraint is likely to prevent accommodation and recognition of antigens with large polar heads, it is generally accepted that antigenic glycolipids and lipoglycans with large oligosaccharide moieties are first processed so that T cell recognition can take place.

Relatively little is known about the molecular mechanisms of glycolipid processing. However, previous work has demonstrated that, to be recognized, the oligosaccharide moiety of Gal( $\alpha$ 1 $\rightarrow$ 2)GalCer must first be cleaved by the lysosomal  $\alpha$ -galactosidase (*17*) in the presence of lipid transfer proteins (LTPs) known as saposins, which are involved in the catabolism of endogenous glycolipids (*18*).

Some species express a particular CD1 isoform, CD1e, which has remained the only member of this protein family with undetermined function. CD1e molecules mainly localize within Golgi compartments of

\*These authors contributed equally to this work. †To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: gennaro.delibero@unibas.ch (G.D.L.); germain. puzo@ipbs.fr (G.P.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>INSERM, U725, Etablissement Francais du Sang-Alsace, F-67065 Strasbourg, France. <sup>2</sup>Experimental Immunology, Department of Research, Basel University Hospital, CH-4031 Basel, Switzerland. <sup>3</sup>CNRS, UMR 5089, Immunochimie et Glycoconjugués Mycobacteriens, and <sup>4</sup>Biophysique Structurale, Département Mécanismes Moléculaires des Infections Mycobactériennes, Institut de Pharmacologie et de Biologie Structurale, F-31077 Toulouse Cedex, France. <sup>5</sup>Department of Medicine and <sup>6</sup>Department of Pathology, University Hospital of Northern Norway, N-9038 Tromsø, Norway. <sup>7</sup>CNRS, UMR 144, Institut Curie, F-75005 Paris, France. <sup>8</sup>INSERM, U311, Etablissement Francais du Sang-Alsace, F-67065 Strasbourg, France.